

Town of Ipswich Architectural Preservation District Commission
Public Hearing
February 27, 2019
Mary Conley Room - Town Hall

Minutes

Members Present: Chris Morse, Nancy Carlisle, Peter Bubriski and Will Thompson

Alternate Members Present: Ruth Strachan, Susan Dolan

Staff Present: Ethan Parsons

Others Present: John Colantoni, Timothy Martins, South Side Green, LLC
John Dugger, J S Dugger & Associates

Mathew Cummings, Cummings Architects
Deirdre Davis, 3 Payne Street, Ipswich, MA
Laura Gresh, 72 Country Road, Ipswich, MA
Scott and Mary Hanna, 3 Poplar Street, Ipswich, MA
Dan Stendahl, 76 County Road, Ipswich, MA
Oleksiy Svitelskiy, #4, 68 County Road, Ipswich, MA

Sarah Winderlin, 87 High Street, Ipswich, MA
Ken Savoie, Savoie Nolan Architects

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order at 7:00 PM. Apologies received previously from Mr. Fiske.

CITIZENS QUERIES: None.

MINUTES AND MATTERS ARISING: Ms. Carlisle moved to accept the previous meeting minutes. Ms. Strachan seconded. Mr. Morse amended the minutes by adding clarifying language for the recommendation that four larger and evenly spaced, two over two, store front style windows be incorporated on the front (west) façade of the existing building. The vote was taken, and the motion passed unanimously.

VOTING MEMBERS: Mr. Morse appointed Ms. Strachan and Ms. Dolan as voting members for the business of 64-66 County Road, due to Mr. Bubriski's absence from the previous meeting. Ms. Strachan was appointed as a voting member for the new business of 87 High Street.

PUBLIC HEARING: 64-66 County Road Certificate to Alter for alterations.

REQUEST for Approval of Certificate to Alter for alterations including addition to existing building and new construction located in the Architectural Preservation District, pursuant to Section 8, Chapter XXII of the Ipswich General Bylaws.

Mr. Morse inquired as to the materials that would be used for the new windows. Mr. Colantoni responded that they would be vinyl. Mr. Morse recommended wood windows. Mr. Cummings commented that wood or metal clad wood windows with simulated divided lights would be in keeping with windows typically incorporated into other projects reviewed by the APDC. Mr. Morse recommended Pella mahogany windows, as well as two-inch window sills. Mr. Colantoni agreed to install wood or metal clad wood windows on the front three sides of the existing building.

Mr. Cummings commented that the metal brackets appear pleasing.

Mr. Colantoni provided an overview of all of the accepted changes that had been proposed in the email provided after the February 13th meeting. Exceptions included incorporating metal roofing on the pent roof on the east (rear) elevation of the new building. Hardie Plank clapboards would be used on the rear of the existing building and the entirety of the new building. Trim would be painted PVC.

Mr. Morse recommended pulling the rake out slightly on unit 4 to improve its appearance.

Mr. Cummings commented that the project would look better if the new building was painted a different, darker color, or if different color windows were incorporated.

Ms. Strachan and Ms. Carlisle expressed preference for wood windows. Mr. Dugger responded that Aluminum clad windows with white exterior grills hold up well over time. Mr. Cummings commented that people who restore houses in Ipswich typically remove vinyl and install wood windows.

Mr. Bubriski commented that he appreciated all of the inputs and efforts made to accommodate the board. Mr. Morse expressed agreement that the project had come a long way and that the project looks much better than initially proposed. Mr. Colantoni expressed agreement, stating that the board should be proud of the project. Mr. Morse added that people will see the building restoration first and appreciate that.

Mr. Morse continued, stating that attributes have been modified on the new building, and that some abutters feel that the project is too large.

Mr. Hanna inquired as to whether there is enough room for a car to turn into the south facing garage attached to the existing building. Mr. Colantoni and Mr. Dugger explained that the engineer had completed a radius study that had been peer reviewed by the Town's engineer.

Ms. Davis and Mr. Svitelskiy both iterated their stances that the new building is too large for the space.

Mr. Cummings iterated his comment that if the new building were painted a darker color with black windows it would not appear as large. Mr. Dugger replied that the team would be happy to incorporate such a color scheme. Mr. Colantoni reminded the board that it has no jurisdiction over colors or paint schemes.

Mr. Hanna commented that the scale is too large, and it will lead to similar infill projects occurring all over town. Mr. Morse replied that Ipswich does not have building area to lot area ratios that could potentially mitigate this particular factor. Mr. Colantoni responded that the project must be considered individually and according to its own merits. He reminded the board that the lot has always had four units, which was already non-conforming, and that no waivers were necessary to get the project approved by the other boards.

General discussion ensued around the merits of incorporating gables versus dormers on the east (rear) elevation, as related to discussions with the Design Review Board. Mr. Colantoni reminded the board that the items on the previously provided list had been incorporated. Mr. Dugger added that the height is the height and there is no way to legislate taste. Ms. Gresh expressed her concern that the rear elevation is not satisfactory based on look, scale and nature of the neighborhood. Mr. Morse expressed disagreement based on the Greek Revival attributes that reflect some of those on the neighboring buildings.

Mr. Cummings commented that the rear elevation pent roof could be extended upward to visually reduce the scale. Mr. Colantoni inquired what Mr. Cummings thought of incorporating metal roofing. Mr. Cummings responded that deliberately different details and colors between the two buildings would make the project look less like a condo complex. Mr. Colantoni stated that the team had no problem incorporating metal or shingles and that they could come back at a later date to discuss colors.

Mr. Stendahl expressed his support and appreciation of the details, stating that the scale and architecture are similar to his neighboring house and barn. Mr. Colantoni provided letters from 16 neighbors who support the development.

MOTION TO ISSUE A CERTIFICATE TO ALTER: Mr. Morse moved to issue a Certificate to Alter, subject to the following conditions: submission of fenestration type and size; single lights installed at entrances; raising the rear elevation pent roof; and extending the south elevation cornice outward. Ms. Carlisle seconded.

Ms. Carlisle expressed concern that the primary disagreement surrounding the development remains the scale of the new building considering the size of the lot and the location adjacent to the South Green.

Ms. Strachan agreed that the new building remains too large.

Ms. Dolan commented that the existing building design has made tremendous progress and agreed that the new building remained too large considering its gateway location and proximity to the Whipple and Heard houses.

The vote was taken, and the motion failed, one in favor, four against.

Mr. Colantoni inquired as to where the project goes from here. Mr. Thompson responded that the new building would likely meet with approval if it could be reduced in scale to two and a half stories. Ms. Strachan added that size and scale are still an issue. Mr. Colantoni responded that the February 13 minutes received from Mr. Parsons did not include decreasing the size of the

building. Mr. Colantoni expressed his disgust and dismay regarding the unfairness of the process. Ms. Carlisle agreed with and expressed great empathy for Mr. Colantoni's view.

Mr. Parsons commented that the bylaw is unlike any other. Mr. Thompson explained the bylaw requirements that the negative determination now requires the board to offer ways for the project to satisfy the APDC, and that once that is done in a manner that the board finds acceptable, it must issue a Certificate to Alter.

Mr. Colantoni responded that the team would be willing to remove one foot from the new building height and shorten the east-west facing elevation by one foot on the southern end, provided a vote was taken tonight.

Mr. Cummings commented as to whether one of the board members could work with the developer separately on the details. Mr. Martins requested that Mr. Cummings cease interjecting his opinions.

Ms. Dolan recommended that the building height be reduced to two and a half stories.

Mr. Dugger, Mr. Colantoni and Mr. Martins requested a short recess, which Mr. Morse granted.

Upon their return, Mr. Dugger stated that the team would return with a two and a half story building. Mr. Martins commented that they did not want to be forced to come back and face another set of changes, and requested fairness in the process. Mr. Colantoni requested a vote on a two and a half story building. Ms. Strachan responded that she would not feel comfortable approving a project that the board had not seen. Mr. Morse commented that a two and a half story building would work for the board. Mr. Parsons recommend the board withdraw its vote.

MOTION TO RESCIND NEGATIVE DETERMINATION: Mr. Morse moved to rescind the vote that had resulted in a negative determination. Ms. Strachan seconded.

The vote was taken, and the motion passed, five in favor, zero against.

Mr. Colantoni expressed his disgust for the proceeding and the disrespect shown by the board members. Ms. Carlisle responded that the board would support a two and a half story project. Mr. Stendahl responded that there was no way to know that definitively, because not all of the board members were speaking. Mr. Thompson expressed appreciation for Mr. Colantoni and Mr. Martins frustration, adding that the no vote had been necessary to force the issue of arriving at a two and a half story project, which the team had been unwilling to accept at the preceding APDC meetings.

The meeting was continued until ^{March} February 4, 2019.

PUBLIC HEARING: 87 High Street Certificate to Alter for the demolition and reconstruction of a building and construction of a new building.

← typo corrected by Mr. Parsons 3/5/19

REQUEST for Approval of Certificate to Alter for the demolition and reconstruction of a building and new construction located in the Architectural Preservation District, pursuant to Section 8, Chapter XXII of the Ipswich General Bylaws.

Ms. Winderlin provided an overview of plans to take down and reconstruct an existing barn, and to also build a new and separate two car garage. Mr. Savoie continued with design details relative to the barn, which included the addition of a sun room and second floor dormer. He explained that the existing structure is light framed with a rubble foundation and an approximately 18-inch crawl space. The structure would remain low to the ground and be built atop a new concrete foundation, potentially with a partial basement to provide additional storage.

Ms. Strachan expressed appreciation for the barn details, adding that neither structure would impact the streetscape due to their lot location behind the main house and existing vegetation.

Ms. Strachan and Mr. Morse expressed appreciation for the garage design. Ms. Winderlin added that the barn project would occur first, and that the garage may follow later as a second phase.

Mr. Morse inquired as to the window specification. Ms. Winderlin responded that vinyl would be used. Mr. Morse recommended that metal clad windows with wood interiors be used. Ms. Winderlin responded that she would appreciate being able to maintain flexibility in the material, but that simulated divided lights would be used. Ms. Carlisle added that the windows are largely out of view from the street, but that for the sake of long-term maintenance, wood or metal windows would be preferable.

Mr. Morse inquired as to whether the Hardie Plank clapboards would be smooth. Mr. Savoie responded affirmatively.

There was general agreement from the board members that the scale and attributes of both buildings, and the provided list of materials were appropriate.

MOTION TO ISSUE A CERTIFICATE TO ALTER: Ms. Carlisle moved to accept the designs as submitted for both the barn and garage, and to issue a Certificate to Alter. Mr. Thompson seconded.

The vote was taken, and the motion passed, five in favor, zero against.

NEW BUSINESS:

Mr. Morse announced his resignation from the APDC, effective March 5, 2019.

A public hearing was set for March 20, 2019 for 24 Summer Street Request for Approval of Certificate to Alter.

ADJOURNMENT: Ms. Carlisle moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Strachan seconded. The motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at 21:34.

Minutes prepared by Will Thompson, Secretary

Attachments: none

minutes adopted 3/4/19